



**SECRET
VALLEY**
GOLF RESORT

COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

TUESDAY 16th, MAY 2023

And

THURSDAY 1st, June 2023

Title	Name
<u>Members:</u>	
Captain	Willie El-Fakir
Vice-Captain	Boris Zilbermints
Competition & Handicap Secretary	Jamie Evans
Assistant Competition & Handicap Secretary	Andy Richardson (Not present for meeting on June 1 st)
Treasurer	Trevor Holden
Ladies Rep	Catrin Koring
IT Member	Olga Lobova
Director of Golf	Adam Collinson

Minutes:

No:	Committee Member	Subject	Action/Responsibility
1.	Captain	Opening address	The Captain opened the meeting at 3:10pm
2.	Captain	Late Start	The Captain apologised for the late start as there had been a private meeting with between the Captain, Vice-Captain and SV management about some email exchanges between committee members and members of the golf club.
		New KO Coordinator Elected	At the previous meeting the Vice-Captain had asked to be relieved of the duties of organizing the knockouts. The Assistant Competition Secretary agreed to take over this responsibility. The committee voted and the decision was unanimous.
3.	Vice-Captain	Review and possibly a decision on the multi tee competitions	CGF has advised that handicaps do account for difficulty difference in multi-tee competitions. Multi-tee will continue but we want to ensure that the prizes are fair and equitable. We will put a poll on the website to get member feedback on how we will proceed going forward for the rest of the year. The Captain volunteered to prepare the poll wording and it will be reviewed and approved by the committee before it is published.



**SECRET
VALLEY**
GOLF RESORT

COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

TUESDAY 16th, MAY 2023

And

THURSDAY 1st, June 2023

		Pace of play	In the Club Championship, the pace of play was very slow on Day 1 in 3 balls. On day 2, we had a mix of 2, 3, and 4 balls. The pace of play was good except for the last group.
			Stablefords do not seem to have a pace of play issue.
			Medals seem to be the format that causes the most issues. As a trial to combat slow pace of play, one suggestion was that the next MEDAL will be 3 balls at 10 minute intervals. This will reduce the field size to 54 players Max. If that goes well, we will reduce the interval to 9 minutes for the next MEDAL to accommodate 60 players.
			The committee highly recommend that members play "Ready Golf". We suggested that management put sings on the course to encourage "Ready Golf"
			Rakes for bunkers. Some bunkers have only 1 rake. Mgt will look at ordering additional rakes.
		Club Championship Presentation Evening	The attendance at this event by members was very poor. Some members said it was too expensive. Many members did not want to wait until the evening for the Presentation to start. Members had to work the next day. Family – they could not stay away so long. Next year we recommend that the presentation be immediately after the final group is finished to encourage members to stay. We also need to look at live Scoring like they CGF does for major competitions.
		Korineum Match	A team is ready. There are 20 players and a small reserve list. Update, match was a success, but were soundly defeated by the home team. Return match may be moved to June 28th.
		Observations from a supervisory trip around the	Mgt Look at putting sponsors on every tee. There is finally some rough on the course.



**SECRET
VALLEY**
GOLF RESORT

COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

TUESDAY 16th, MAY 2023

And

THURSDAY 1st, June 2023

		course with DOG and Course Super.	
5.	Competition Secretary	Home Club Criteria for Club Champion	An email was received regarding the criteria to be "Club Champion". The current criteria is that your home handicap needs to be at Secret Valley. As the Club Championship is completed, the criteria can be reviewed by next year's committee.
		Committee members answering emails that were not addressed to them	The Competition Secretary was disappointed that a committee member answered an email that had been directed to him before he had a chance to reply. The committee member in question stated that they replied to the member directly and expressed their personal opinion and personal recollection and did not reply on behalf of the committee.
		KO Extensions	The Competition Secretary asked for clarification as to why the Vice-Captain did not offer a medical extension to a club member who was injured on day 1 of the club championships. The member was very unhappy about not being granted an extension and the situation escalated quickly. After reading the barrage of emails back and forth the Captain decided to step in and do some damage control for this situation. Below are the emails sent back and forth on this subject on May 15th. The Captain wrote the following message to the Vice-Captain on May 15th at 11:46: "I am very surprised at the tone and the language of your emails to (the member). We as members of the committee serve the members of this club and we need to set and maintain a high standard in all correspondence with members. I have over-ridden your decision and granted the member a 2 week medical extension for her injury.



**SECRET
VALLEY**
GOLF RESORT

COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

TUESDAY 16th, MAY 2023

And

THURSDAY 1st, June 2023

			We will discuss this in detail tomorrow at the committee meeting.” The Vice-Captain replied on 15 May 2023, at 13:16: “I am very surprised with your double standards. So when I wrote to her wishing a speedy recovery and (the member) blasting me back with "disgusting" etc. sits well with you, and when I am using (the member's) style of correspondence it's not good... Please show me anywhere in the rules of the Club that a Captain has an authority to overrule a decision made by VC. You would not be able to because you do not have this right. The Club has a Disciplinary Committee (read Code of Conduct) and that Committee is authorised to review the behaviour issues. For as long as I am responsible for KO competitions (hopefully Andy will take over from May 16th) I take decisions related to KO, not you. I respectfully ask you to write to (the member) ASAP and advise (the member) that what you wrote earlier today was your personal opinion and that her issue will be discussed tomorrow when a Committee meeting will make a decision. I very much look forward to our meeting tomorrow and I will add some issues to the proposed Agenda. Majority of the Club members boycotted yesterday's dinner because they are in a deep disagreement with your actions as the Club Captain. I came yesterday and brought 12 people with me only because of Catrin's efforts to organise the event (to which you provided minimum assistance).” The Captain wrote the following email at 16:33 on May 15th: “As per your multiple requests, please consider yourself officially relieved of the responsibility of
--	--	--	--



**SECRET
VALLEY**
GOLF RESORT

COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

TUESDAY 16th, MAY 2023

And

THURSDAY 1st, June 2023

			being the knockout coordinator. The Assistant Competition Secretary will handle this responsibility effective immediately.” The Vice-Captain replied at 16:48: “Once again you are overstepping your authority! This is a Committee decision, not yours! And it will be made at the meeting tomorrow. Stop acting as if the Club belongs to you, because it does not!” The Captain replied at 17:01: My decision on (the member) stands. We will vote tomorrow (at the committee meeting). The Vice-Captain replied at 17:10: “That is a clear example of Democracy American way, Uncle Sam makes a decision, and the world needs to live with it. Not this time my friend. Until the vote is held the decision is NOT valid. Moreover, you violated the rules and clearly overstepped your authority. Unlike you, who were "elected" without any alternatives, read - appointed, I was elected in a contested electoral process and the majority of the members of the Club trusted me to stop people like you to do whatever they want as if the Club belongs to them. At 6 pm, if there will be nothing from you, I shall write and explain to the member.” At that point the Director of Golf stepped in and asked that there be no further communication with the member on this subject and invited the Vice-Captain to meet with himself, the Secret Valley General Manager and the Captain the following day at 2 PM before the committee meeting.
--	--	--	---



**SECRET
VALLEY**
GOLF RESORT

COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

TUESDAY 16th, MAY 2023

And

THURSDAY 1st, June 2023

			The following day at the meeting with SV management this subject was discussed at length and the Captain and the Vice-Captain both agreed that the situation could have been handled better by both. The Captain apologized twice for overstepping his authority on two occasions and Vice-Captain apologized for the phrase "Democracy American way".
6	Treasurer	May Accounts	The May accounts are complete and have been published on the website.
		Safe	A safe as purchased to hold committee funds as we are unable to open a bank account.
7.	Member Representative	Sponsorship	None of the sponsors were able to attend the prize presentation. The Member Representative produced 2 very nice videos (one long and one short) for the sponsors. The feedback was very positive. All invoices have been given to sponsors for payment.
		Resignation	The member representative resigned after the meeting on June 1st. An email was sent to all members on June 13th with the reasons for her resignation.
8.	AOB	Disqualification	The Vice-Captain was very unhappy that he had been disqualified for playing at the wrong time (breach of rule 5.4b) in the SVOOM 3 on May 27th. The circumstances were reviewed, and the competition sub-committee voted 4 to 1 to disqualify the Vice-Captain. A member must play at the time that he has been assigned unless he has been given permission by the committee (represented by the competition secretary) to change tee times. Now there are exceptions to this, for example if players do not show up and the course marshal asks a player to move forward or backward to help with the pace of play. Below is a copy of the email exchange on this subject:



**SECRET
VALLEY**
GOLF RESORT

COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

TUESDAY 16th, MAY 2023

And

THURSDAY 1st, June 2023

			May 26 @ 20:21 “sorry for the late notice. I need to get kids to a b-day party tomorrow and I can't make it if I start late, I will join the flight at 07:20 (with name redacted) there are just three of them. I will inform the Pro shop and marshal.” May 27th @ 14:44 The email below was sent to the competition sub-committee members including the Vice-Captain. R&A Rules of Golf - Rule 5.4b Stroke Play - During a round, the player must remain in the group set by the Committee, unless the Committee approves a change either before or after it happens. Penalty for breach of Rule 5.4: Disqualification. There was a breach of Rule 5.4b in the SVOOM 3 Competition today. A player (Boris Zilbermints - email copied below) changed groups from 0820 to 0720 without permission from the committee. Please advise by 7pm today (as I am ready to publish the results) that the DQ should apply. May 27 @ 18:35 “enough is enough with your witch hunt! Plenty of players change their flights, they just inform the marshal, this was also the case in a flight in front of mine and happens all the time and this is the first time ever I hear that a player needs to get a committee decision. You all know that this is completely impossible and has never been the case. It
--	--	--	---



SECRET
VALLEY
GOLF RESORT

COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

TUESDAY 16th, MAY 2023

And

THURSDAY 1st, June 2023

			was always enough to inform the Compsec or even just a marshal. I did write to Jamie yesterday evening and explained the reason, he did not respond, as I see now it was done on purpose. I informed Adam in the Proshop when I came for the registration at 06:50, I informed George, the marshal. I did absolutely everything by the book and <u>existing practises</u> and you have no right whatsoever to DQ me. Moreover you are doing this intentionally for the second competition in a row. We planned to have a Committee meeting on Monday outside of the Club in Pissouri. I now disagree with that. The Committee meeting must be held at the Club premises, and we can discuss and decide there and then. I am taking the liberty of inviting Adam and Nicos. Most probably my lawyer will be present this time.” May 28 @ 8:01 “despite everything I said and despite the fact that the issues should have been discussed at the Committee you DQ me. You had two votes for DQ and one vote against. Committee consists of 7 members and in order to DQ me you should have had at least 4 votes, which you did not have. But in reality, it has never bothered you because the whole purpose of your action was to harm me. You dugged out the rule that has NEVER been used and applied it in my case. You did not care about what the Committee might decide because you think you can do whatever you wish at the club. You bend the rules anyway it suits you, it happens to me, it has recently happened to (another member), and has been happening for a while. I strongly object to your personal decision to DQ me and you have clearly overstepped your authority. I demand you withdraw your decision with an
--	--	--	---



**SECRET
VALLEY**
GOLF RESORT

COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

TUESDAY 16th, MAY 2023

And

THURSDAY 1st, June 2023

			immediate effect and let the Committee decide as it should be by procedure. All my legal rights are reserved." May 28 @ 10:01 "the Committee does not set the groups at SV competitions draws and definitely did not do this in your case. Therefore Rule 5.4b is not applicable in this particular case". As I mentioned before you had no right whatsoever to DQ me and I am expecting a proper written apology. All my legal rights are reserved." This was also discussed in detail at the committee meeting on June 1st.
		Competition Sub-committee	The Vice-Captain stated that he was not aware that there was a competition sub-committee and that he was a member of it. The Captain showed the Vice-Captain the Terms of Reference that was sent to all members and posted on the website (January 13, 2023) that states that the Vice-Captain is a member of this sub-committee. The Vice-Captain stated that he believes that most members did not know that this sub-committee exists. The Captain stated that most golf clubs have this sub-committee. For those members who do not know, the function of this sub-committee is to handle rule breaches in accordance with the Rules of Golf on the day of competitions. The committee consists of the Captain, Vice-Captain, Competition Secretary, Assistant Competition Secretary and the Director of Golf
		Corporate Members	The Director of Golf clarified that Corporate members are given 1 x 4 ball tee time every day of the week. They are allowed to play in member competitions subject to availability. He assured the committee that



**SECRET
VALLEY**
GOLF RESORT

COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

TUESDAY 16th, MAY 2023

And

THURSDAY 1st, June 2023

			corporate tickets were not being abused as he checks the dates used for each corporate ticket every month.
		Vote of No-Confidence	The assistant competition secretary was unable to attend the meeting on June 1st, but wrote a letter to the committee highlighting his concerns with the conduct of the Vice-Captain since he joined the committee. The assistant competition secretary proposed a vote of no confidence for the Vice-Captain and asked for him to be removed from his current office. The motion was seconded by the Captain. The vote results were as follows: - Captain – Yes - Vice-Captain – No - Competition Secretary – Yes - Assistant Competition Secretary – Yes - Member Representative – Abstain - Treasurer – Abstain - IT Member - Abstain It should be noted that the committee has no authority to remove a committee member from the committee. Nevertheless, management and members are now being formally advised of this vote.
		Treasurer's comments on the minutes	June 14 at 15:59 "I believe we must publish all or nothing. Everyone stands by what they have written. We can redact names of other members. Everyone needs to see how certain people conduct their business. I will not feel threatened by individuals who simply do not get things their own way who then threaten legal action. I am a volunteer. This cannot carry on."
		Assistant Competition Secretary's comments on the minutes	June 14th 20:11 "For the record, as much as I appreciate these minutes should be published as soon as possible, I would like it recorded that I do NOT agree that they be published



**SECRET
VALLEY**
GOLF RESORT

COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

TUESDAY 16th, MAY 2023

And

THURSDAY 1st, June 2023

			without my letter detailing my reasoning in asking for a vote of no confidence in the Vice-Captain. This letter was read out at an official committee meeting and should be a matter of public record. Please publish this email within the minutes.”
		Captain’s comments on the minutes	June 14th at 21:02 “The Assistant Competition Secretary’s letter was read at the meeting on May 16th and is a document of public record and will be made available to the members ASAP. The letter from the Assistant Competition Secretary’s letter is not being published at this time because the Vice-Captain sent an objection in an email (see below). As soon as the Vice-Captain replies, the minutes will be updated with 2 Annexes. Annex 1 will be the email from the Assistant Competition Secretary. Annex 2 will be the reply from the Vice-Captain. I apologize for the delay in the publication of these minutes.”
		Vice-Captain’s comments on the minutes	June 13th at 18:51: “I also disagree with publishing of the Assistant Competition Secretary’s letter as it was not discussed at the meeting, and you immediately proceeded to his suggestion to vote. The letter is full of lies and ungrounded and false accusations to which I have not been given a chance to respond.”
		The First Meeting ended at 16:30 on May 16th. The resumed meeting on Jun 1st started at 16:00 and ended at 18:00	

Regards,

Willie El-Fakir
Club Captain
Secret Valley Golf Resort